

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission  
Architectural Review Committee  
Meeting Minutes

Date: June 26, 2018

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8<sup>th</sup> Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, LA, 70112.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 5:00 p.m.

Members present: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting: Wayne Troyer

Members absent: Beth Jacob

**I. AGENDA**

1. Approval of the minutes of the May 22, 2018 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, Wayne Troyer arrived.

2. 527 Elysian Fields Ave.

Application: Rick A. Fifield, applicant; Khrisos Inc, owner; Renovation of an existing two-story commercial building to include the restoration of an historic gallery and a new side gallery at the Chartres Street elevation.

Speaker: Allen Johnson spoke in favor of the application.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details of the gallery at Chartres Street to return to the ARC for additional review. The ARC agreed that the handrails at the Elysian Fields Ave gallery reconstruction should be detailed closer to the original condition as the proposed top and bottom rails appear much lighter than the original condition.

Second: Wayne Troyer

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 1600 Magazine St.  
Application: Cornelius Payne, applicant; 1600 Magazine LLC, owner; New construction of a three story, multi-family building for commercial short term rental and/or bed and breakfast.  
Speaker: John Harkins spoke in opposition to the application.  
Motion: Wayne Troyer made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC had concern with the vehicular focus and the lack of pedestrian interaction on the ground floor. The site planning strategy needs further study, mainly how the building addresses Magazine St. Additional diagrams of the Entergy lines would also be helpful to understand the reason behind the underdeveloped areas of the site.  
Second: John Klingman  
Result: Passed  
In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer  
Opposed:  
Comments:
4. 2627 Tchoupitoulas St.  
Application: John Lambertson, applicant; Tchoup Party Stop LLC, owner; Demolition of three (3) existing one-story warehouse buildings and new construction of five-story, self-storage facility.  
Motion: John Klingman made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The brick veneer presented at the ARC was overly rusticated and did not accurately recreate appropriate brickwork. The ARC agreed that the metal panels with the concealed fasteners would be approvable, but they would like to see more detail in plan section, section and partial elevations. The banding at the 4th and 5th floors needs to be further studied, there should be a hierarchy between the vertical and horizontal pieces as represented in the renderings.  
Second: Cynthia Dubberley  
Result: Passed  
In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer  
Opposed:  
Comments:
5. 3200 Chartres St.  
Application: Michael Bosio, applicant; 3200 Chartres Street Investment Group LI, owner; New construction of a 28,000 SF mixed-use development.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the ARC level. The ARC made the following recommendations:
- Increase size of the parapet to create more space between top of windows and top of parapet.
  - Eliminate the cornice detailing at the brick portion of the building.
  - Design a handrail on the riverside of the building to match style of building to replace generic pipe-railing as proposed.
- Second: John Klingman  
Result: Passed  
In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer  
Opposed:  
Comments:

6. 514 Franklin Ave.

Application: Jeffrey E Treffinger, applicant; Primmoz Abs LLC, owner; New construction of 32,000 SF mixed-use building.

Speaker: Allen Johnson spoke in favor of the application.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the ARC level. The ARC agreed that the overhang at the fourth (4th) floor terrace should be pulled back at the Franklin Ave and Spain St elevations with the projection remaining at Decatur St to align with the floor slab. The ARC agreed that the 'privacy fin' at the fourth (4th) floor terrace is awkward and should either be removed or replaced with a more transparent material. Regarding the windows, the ARC agreed that the windows should reflect the horizontality of the proposal and suggested using the paired hopper windows at far left side of the fourth (4th) floor east elevation as a guide. The ARC also requested that the materiality of the lower levels be further studied for presentation at the next ARC meeting.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 1825 Sophie Wright Pl. .

Application: Terry Schellhaas, applicant; William R Powe, owner; Construct a new, 5,252 SF three-story, mixed-use building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC had some initial concerns with the entry of the building and the massing within the context. The stair entry to the commercial space on Sophie Wright Pl seems alien to the neighborhood, you may need to mitigate access on the interior of the building or make the building a rectangle, similar to its neighbors, to allow for a transition to the entry. The massing overshadows the neighboring 1-2 story buildings of the surrounding blocks and the gallery seems to emphasize this condition. Additionally, the combination of a gallery and a recessed first floor is inappropriate. The exterior fire stair, if not required, should be mitigated internally if desired by the owner. The ARC agreed that the overall design needed further study and would like 3-D renderings of the building within the context for the upcoming review.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 906 Philip St.

Application: Cangelosi, Jr Robert, applicant; Michael H Pelias, owner; Camelback addition to existing one story, residential building.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The windows at the front of the camelback should be raised to a 3'-0" sill height. The roof pitch of the addition should match the existing roof pitch of the one story building.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 4506 Canal St.  
Application: Cangelosi, Jr Robert, applicant; Emile J Brinkmann, owner; Site modifications to include alterations and repairs to an existing arbor and site updates with the installation of a new swimming pool on a Landmark building.  
Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended shifting the proposed fence off the existing quoins and into the brick field at the right side elevation.  
Second: Elliott Perkins  
Result: Passed  
In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer  
Opposed:  
Comments:
9. 1015 Congress St.  
Application: Loretta Harmon, applicant; Robert A Jr Couch, owner; Renovation of existing residential double into a single family residential building. Work includes removal of front door and additional windows throughout building.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to deny the removal of the door on the front elevation of the building and removal of historic windows on the side elevations. However, the ARC recommended conceptual approval of the remainder of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.  
Second: Cynthia Dubberley  
Result: Passed  
In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer  
Opposed:  
Comments:
10. 623 Bartholmew St.  
Application: Loretta Harmon, applicant; Jeffery L Underwood, Tedesco Torres LLC, owner; Renovation of an existing single-family residential building, including alterations to the configuration on the front facade.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:  
  - Increase width of new window on façade to be 3'-0".
  - Match the header heights of the existing windows on the side elevations to the header heights of the proposed façade.  
Second: Cynthia Dubberley  
Result: Passed  
In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer  
Opposed:  
Comments:
11. 3140 Annunciation St.  
Application: Donald Maginnis, applicant; Thomas Maginnis, owner; Reconfigure existing openings on double shotgun, remove existing door and stairs to install window.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to deny your request to remove a door and stair from the front elevation of a double shotgun to accommodate a single family use.  
Second: Cynthia Dubberley  
Result: Passed  
In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer  
Opposed:  
Comments:

13. 2233 Dauphine St.  
Application: Donald Maginnis, applicant; Gulf Coast Bank & Trust, owner; Modification to the front elevation to include reconstruction of front porch.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend denial of the application. The ARC agreed that the double height columns are not appropriate for this structure and recommended repairing the porch in a manner more in keeping with the existing configuration. The ARC did, however, agree that masonry columns at the first floor and wood columns at the second floor would align with a raised basement building and may be an approvable proposal.  
Second: Cynthia Dubberley  
Result: Passed  
In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer  
Opposed:  
Comments:
14. 1236 First St.  
Application: Brandon Hart, applicant; Lawrence N Hjersted, owner; Construction of a two-story pool house.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend denial of this application. The ARC agreed that the new two-story pool house is out of scale for an accessory structure and should not be more than a single-story. The applicant should confirm the maximum height for an accessory structure with Zoning. The ARC further noted that the accessory structure should not be closer to the front property line than the front wall of the house (not the porch).  
Second: Cynthia Dubberley  
Result: Passed  
In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer  
Opposed:  
Comments:
15. 500 Slidell St.  
Application: Chris Tayeh, applicant; Maurice Tayeh, owner; Construct double gallery on existing two-story, residential building.  
Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that although dormers are not typically seen on the side elevations of shotgun buildings, due to the period and style of this particular building they may be approvable; however, the style and proportions of the dormers need to be modified. Rather than typical gabled dormers, they suggested shed-roofed dormers, which would be more consistent with the Craftsman-style elements on the building. The shed roofs should start below the existing ridge line. The dormers should also be wider and lower to create a more horizontal proportion, with shorter windows. They suggested looking at shed-roofed dormers on Craftsman-style bungalows for reference.  
Second: Elliott Perkins  
Result: Passed  
In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer  
Opposed:  
Comments:

16. 3321 St Charles Ave.  
Application: Diane Hickman, applicant; Donald's Corp (017/0107), owner; New construction of 4,300 SF commercial building (McDonald's).  
Speaker: Jack D. Wilson spoke in favor of the application.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details surrounding the drive-thru 'Fast Forward' element return to the ARC for additional review.  
Second: Cynthia Dubberley  
Result: Passed  
In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer  
Opposed:  
Comments:
17. 2223 Carondelet St.  
Application: Rodney Ratliff, applicant; 2223 Carondelet LLC, owner; New construction of a two-story, single-family residential building.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with details to be worked out at Staff level. The ARC stated that the windows on the side elevations, closest to the front facade, should move back from the edge of the building. The ARC suggested that louvered shutters be used instead of paneled shutters.  
Second: Cynthia Dubberley  
Result: Passed  
In favor:  
Opposed: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer  
Comments:
18. 1431 Clouet St.  
Application: Clifton James, applicant; Bywater Bayou Living LLC, Bywater Bayou Living, LLC, owner; New construction of a 1668 SF single-family residential building  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer action on this item due to lack of response to previous ARC results or meeting representation.  
Second: Cynthia Dubberley  
Result: Passed  
In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer  
Opposed:  
Comments:

At this time, all applications were heard in the order of the applicant's arrival.

19. 3700 N Rampart St.  
Application: Joseph Lavigne, applicant; 3700 N Rampart LLC, owner; New construction of a 2-story, 1910 SF single family residential building.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.  
Second: Wayne Troyer  
Result: Passed  
In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer  
Opposed:  
Comments:

20. 3610 St Claude Ave..

Application: John Guarnieri, applicant; Ywllow Slide LLC, owner; New construction of two-family residential building

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Shading element on West side of front second story porch should be continuous and not break at façade of building.
- East side elevation needs more openings. These openings should be detailed in a manner similar to the other windows on metal clad portions of the building.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments: Wayne Troyer recused himself.

21. 526 Marigny St.

Application: John Guarnieri, applicant; 511 LLC, owner; New construction of a three-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that shifting the third floor back from Marigny St is successful in reducing the mass at the street and aligning with the scale of the context. The ARC suggested investigating strategies to bring light through the greenscreen into the central stair.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

22. 406 St Maurice Ave.

Application: Seamus McGuire, applicant; Ethel M Louis, owner; Rehabilitate existing building which collapsed during renovation. New home to be single story, single family residential building to match original building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

23. 830 Fourth St.

Application: Steven J Finegan Architects, applicant; Kim Uyen Thi Tran, owner; Renovation of existing shotgun double into a single family home with camelback addition.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The camelback addition should be setback a minimum of two full rooms from the front wall of the building. The openings at the front should remain, the door and transoms could be restored to the original condition.

Replacement with a window and the removal of the second stair would not be appropriate. The windows at the front of the camelback addition should be symmetrical and the sill height raised closer to 3'-0". The windows at the side elevation need to be further studied, as proposed they are too close the edge of front wall.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

24. 1468 N Claiborne Ave.

Application: Tuong Xuan Nguyen, applicant; Seop Rhim, owner; Construction of 600 SF addition at rear and changes to front facade.

Speaker: Louis Kony spoke in favor of the application.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with details to be worked out at Staff level. The ARC recommended shifting the door and window configuration at the front of the building so that they are bilaterally symmetric across the front of the building.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

25. 1131 Terspichore St.

Application: James Brown, applicant; Coliseum Place Baptist Church, owner; Construct two story, single family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The brackets should be as deep as the overhang, these can be custom milled or salvage but must be submitted for approval prior to purchase and installation.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

26. 417 Tupelo St.

Application: Joshua Noland, applicant; James J Ballas, owner; Camelback addition to an existing single family, one-story residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins recommended a deferral of the proposal and agreed that the applicant should meet with the HDLC staff prior to returning to the ARC due to the complexity of site limitations. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Move the front wall of the camelback towards the rear of the building such that it is in line with the rear most interior wall of the second room from the façade of the building.
- The windows on the front wall of the camelback addition need to be located closer to the corners of the building and away from the ridge line of the existing building.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

27. 828 Gallier St.

Application: Lewis Robinson, applicant; Lisa M Laursen, owner; Conversion of existing detached garage to a two-story apartment attached to the existing house.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the columns as proposed are large for the proposed location and should be replaced with smaller columns as would typically be found on service wings.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

28. 2523 Prytania St.

Application: Barry Fox, applicant; James R, II Dugan, owner; Construction of 1551 SF detached garage and 320 SF, two-story accessory structure.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend denial of the 1551 SF detached garage. The ARC agreed that the new construction of the detached garage was too large along the street face, and recommended approval of the second story accessory structure.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

29. 337 Morgan St.

Application: Robert Pell, applicant/owner; Install impact-rated metal shutters on new two-story mixed-use building; product review.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC felt that because this is a new construction, “non-contributing” building, the installation of the louvered metal shutters would be acceptable in this case, provided they can be installed properly within the casings and have the correct historic hardware. The faux tilt-bar should also be eliminated. The installation of the fasteners for the corrugated Lexan panel tracks is also approvable. The fasteners should be installed and painted to minimize visibility.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

30. 5460 Royal St.

Application: Marc Berard Jr, applicant; Cole Wollerman, owner; New construction 2,360 SF residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer a recommendation for conceptual approval. The ARC agreed that the proposal still does not appear to have a regularized, or systematically placed window arrangement which would be appropriate for this building. The ARC also made the following recommendations:

- Windows need to be symmetrically placed on the front wall of the camelback.
- Add window(s) to the left side elevation second floor.
- The roof pitch over the side entry needs to be of a steeper pitch.
- Flood vents need to be located in a location centered on the windows above, not one under the column.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

31. 3434 St Charles Ave.

Comments: This item was withdrawn.

32. 405 Frenchman St.

Comments: This item was withdrawn.

At this time, there being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.